Я очень рад, что я сегодня здесь, в вашей красивой столице, среди хороших партнёров.
The Principles and challenges of accrediting double/multiple degree programmes in the EU and CIS

or

Is it worth it?

Dr. Anthony J Vickers
The University of Essex,
UK Bologna Expert
Presentation Summary

• What are joint degree programmes?
• What are the General Principles?
• Legislation
• Accreditation/Recognition/Transparency
• What are the Challenges?
• Summary
If you want to be incrementally better: Be competitive.

If you want to be exponentially better: Be cooperative.
What are Joint Degree Programmes?

THE COMMITTEE OF THE CONVENTION ON THE RECOGNITION OF QUALIFICATIONS CONCERNING HIGHER EDUCATION IN THE EUROPEAN REGION THIRD SESSION Strasbourg, 9 June 2004

5. A joint degree should, for the purposes of this Recommendation, be understood as referring to a higher education qualification issued jointly by at least two or more higher education institutions or jointly by one or more higher education institutions and other awarding bodies, on the basis of a study programme developed and/or provided jointly by the higher education institutions, possibly also in cooperation with other institutions.

A joint degree may be issued as;

a joint diploma in addition to one or more national diplomas

a joint diploma issued by the institutions offering the study programme in question without being accompanied by any national diploma

one or more national diplomas issued officially as the only attestation of the joint qualification in question.
What are Joint Degree Programmes?

Peter Williams (QAA) introduced a possible typology to describe the nature of awards resulting from joint degree programmes between two institutions (institution A and institution B). Three possible outcomes were described:

A single award from one of the participating institutions (either from A or B)

Dual awards (one from A and one from B)

A joint award (one award from [AB]). This is the most challenging to address in terms of the legal implications of pooling degree awarding powers.

Joint programmes may have many advantages such as offering a broader experience to students, demonstrating international commitment and branding benefits.
What are Joint Degree Programmes?

"A joint programme is a programme offered jointly by different higher education institutions irrespective of the degree (joint, multiple and double) awarded."

The recognition of qualifications awarded by joint programmes

Note that this definition is not the same as the previous two. This definition specifies that a joint degree results in a single award.
A Possible Generalisation

We can think three components to joint degrees;

1. The degree programme of study
   Who designs it and who delivers it?

2. The degree award
   Who makes the award(s) and does any one award contain the names of more than one Institution?

3. The accreditation of the degree programme and/or award
   Who accredits or audits the degree programme?
General Principles

6. Holders of joint degrees should have adequate access, upon request, to a fair assessment of their qualifications.

7. Competent recognition authorities should recognize foreign joint degrees unless they can demonstrate that there is a substantial difference between the joint degree for which recognition is sought and the comparable qualification within their own national higher education system. Competent recognition authorities of Parties whose higher education institutions confer joint degrees should recognize these degrees with the greatest flexibility possible.
8. Governments of States party to the Lisbon Recognition Convention should, where appropriate, therefore review their legislation with a view to removing any legal obstacles to the recognition of joint degrees and introduce legal provisions that would facilitate such recognition.
4. Powers of the University

Subject to the provisions of the Charter and Statutes, and in the furtherance of its objects, the University shall have all the powers of a natural person including, but not limited to, power:

a. in relation to teaching and research:
   i. to provide instruction and programmes of study and research;
   ii. to engage in scholarship and conduct research;
   iii. to admit applicants to programmes of study in accordance with their qualifications or experience;
   iv. to determine fees in relation to programmes of study and to require payment of such fees;
   v. to determine and conduct appropriate forms of assessment, including examinations;
   vi. to confer degrees and grant other academic awards;
   vii. to withdraw degrees and other academic awards conferred or granted by the University;

b. in relation to students:
   i. to prescribe rules for the discipline of Students;
   ii. to determine procedures for the hearing of complaints by Students;

c. in relation to staff:
   i. to employ Staff in such positions as may be required, and to prescribe their conditions of service.

d. in relation to other institutions:
   i. to affiliate other institutions, or branches or departments of other institutions;
   ii. to co-operate and collaborate with other institutions;
   iii. to award joint degrees and other academic awards with other institutions;
   iv. to incorporate into the University any other institution and take over its rights, property and liabilities, for any purpose not inconsistent with the Charter.
On 1 July 2010, Article 7.3c of the Dutch Higher Education and Research Act (Wet op het hoger onderwijs en wetenschappelijk onderzoek) took effect. This article regulates the ‘joint programme’, often referred to as a ‘joint degree’.

A joint programme is a programme that is offered by a Dutch institution in collaboration with one or more other Dutch or foreign institutions of higher education, for which the collaborating institutions bear joint responsibility and for which each collaborating Dutch institution offers a substantial part of the programme. This means that the programme must be given at a minimum of two locations.¹
Accreditation/Recognition/Transparency

Joint programmes: Too many cooks in the kitchen?
The Challenges for Accreditation, Recognition and Transparency of Joint Programmes - A Conference publication -

Conclusion

- Assessment of a joint qualification becomes “easier” when higher education institutions give clear and transparent information regarding their joint programmes and qualifications awarded.
- The “Recommendations on the Recognition of Joint Degrees” adopted in 2004 should be updated by the LRC Committee in order to have clear and adapted guidelines.
- It is essential to share the difficulties on the assessment of the joint degrees with the higher education institutions in order to increase their awareness on the recognition issue.

The ENIC and NARIC Centres recommend an official listing of all the European joint (degree) programmes, which will make it easier to distinguish real recognised joint degrees from joint degrees offered in grey zones.

- As the development of joint programmes has increased around the world, the implementation of a legal framework has become essential in order to have clear rules or guidelines on the setting up of joint programmes.
- Student involvement regarding the recognition problems of joint programmes is recommended.
- The ENIC and NARIC Centres recommend an official listing of all the European joint (degree) programmes, which will make it easier to distinguish the real recognised joint degrees from joint degrees offered in grey zones.
So how is it done and what are the Challenges?

I will take some examples and present any challenges that were faced.
LLB English and French Laws (with Maîtrise) (4-Years)

At Essex, we believe that the key to a lawyer being able to work effectively in a foreign legal system or on foreign legal matters is the ability to think as would a nationally trained lawyer. This standard of competence, however, is rarely achieved because the typical lawyer’s mind has been shaped by the legal education she receives in Law School.

This double course is designed with the twin goals of providing students with a working knowledge of both the French and English legal systems, and with demonstrating a comparative perspective. Students will be introduced to both the French and English legal systems at the same time, and from the outset, in order to encourage them to compare the different approaches adopted in each jurisdiction and the different legal tools used. The objective of the course is to enable students to gain a deep understanding of what separates and what brings together the French and English legal systems, in a way that very few comparitive lawyers achieve.

This course provides students with exemption from the academic stage of the Bar Vocational Course and the Legal Practice Course (UK) through a qualifying law course. Students passing the course will also be awarded a Licence en Droit from the University Paris Ouest Nanterre la Defense (UPOND) ex. Paris XI), or Lyon III), or Toulouse 1 in their third year, and a Maître en droit or Master 1 (M 1), in their fourth year.

All candidates admitted to the course will spend their first two years at Essex where they will receive tuition in the subject areas needed to proceed to the professional training stage for qualification for the practice of law in the UK. All modules will be taken in accordance with rules, regulations and curricular requirements prescribed by the University of Essex.

The students’ final two years will be spent at one of our three French partners studying for the Licence en droit (year three) and Maîtrise en droit (year four).

UCAS Code: M122 LLB/EFLM

Entry Requirements:
A levels: AAB (including French at grade A if non-native)
IB: 31 points (7 points in French if non-native)
French Baccalaureate: 12

Please note that interviews are compulsory for this course. It is part of the entry requirements that all applicants must pass an oral and/or written assessment in French.

Admissions:
Please see the prospectus for further information and for non-UK qualifications. Any queries can be directed to Dr. Guinichard at sbaqum@essex.ac.uk or to admis@essex.ac.uk or the law admissions adviser at ugrad4@essex.ac.uk.

The National Admissions Test for Law (LNAT) - The University of Essex does not require students to sit the LNAT test. It forms no part of our admissions procedure.

French Language Requirements:
Non-native French speakers are required to show proficiency in the French language. For non-French applicants this might be in the form of A level French at A grade plus a period of practical application. Please contact us if you have queries.

Academic Staff:
Dr. Audrey Guinichard
Dr. David Marrani

http://www.essex.ac.uk/law/ugstudy/degrees/m122.asp
This course provides students with exemption from the academic stage of the Bar Vocational Course and the Legal Practice Course (UK) through a qualifying law course. Students passing the course will also be awarded a Licence en Droit from the University Paris Ouest Nanterre la Defense (UPOND ex. Paris X), or Lyon III, or Toulouse 1 in their third year, and a Maîtrise en droit or Master 1 (M 1), in their fourth year.

All candidates admitted to the course will spend their first two years at Essex where they will receive tuition in the subject areas needed to proceed to the professional training stage for qualification for the practice of law in the UK. All modules will be taken in accordance with rules, regulations and curricular requirements prescribed by the University of Essex.

The students' final two years will be spent at one of our three French partners studying for the Licence en droit (year three) and Maîtrise en droit (year four).

Satisfactory completion of the first two years in Essex will be deemed by our French partners to satisfy the requirements for admission to the study of the Licence at the our French partners. Satisfactory completion of the final two years in France will be deemed by Essex to satisfy all remaining requirements for the LLB in English and French Laws.
Principles, challenges, and features
(David Marrani, Co-Director LLB English and French Laws, University of Essex, UK)

1. Choosing partners requires care. You need to consider differences.
2. It is likely that you will only recruit a small number of students so consider the resources needed carefully.
3. Administration is immense: you really need one admin person specifically on the job, if possible bilingual (!). Admin task covers the job of UG dir. for the scheme, plus: one to one recruitment in UK and France, assessing linguistic ability and motivation of students; day to day management with partners (in French of course); monitoring the performance and employability of your students.
4. You need stability of the programme administration.
5. You need motivated candidates. A programme delivered at two sites is demanding.
6. Employability is very high and former students get very good position (our former graduates work for the EU commission, in lobby group at Brussels, as lawyers- 3 are attorneys at law in NY and LA, a few are advocates in France or solicitors in the UK, one is a judge in France, many have done Masters either in France (M2) or UK in very prestigious Universities like LSE, Oxford,...and they are successful candidates for ‘double masters’ like SciencesPo LSE or SciencesPo/Georgetown.
7. Having this kind of degree is a mark of quality
STUDENT MOBILITY:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student mobility</th>
<th>University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First semester</td>
<td>Autonomous University of Barcelona</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second semester</td>
<td>University of Milan or University of Montpellier I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third semester</td>
<td>University of Szczecin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth semester</td>
<td>In a partner or associate University.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASSOCIATE UNIVERSITIES</td>
<td>COLLABORATING UNIVERSITIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Turin (Italy)</td>
<td>University of Barcelona (Spain)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Open University of Spain (Spain)</td>
<td>HUB-KU Brussels University (Belgium)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Essex (UK)</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOM Munich (Germany)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hochschule München (Germany)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Lapland (Finland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marmara University (Turkey)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MGIMO University of Moscow (Russia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Orebro (Sweden)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Paris I (France)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Regensburg (Germany)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Warsaw (Poland)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Principles, challenges, and features
(Professor Teresa Freixes, Co-ordinator, European Master in Law and Policies of European integration, Autonomous University of Barcelona)

1. Although teaching occurs on at least three sites the specific teachers are decided by the Management Board. It is possible that the teachers involved at a site may not be local teachers.
2. A single joint award.
3. There is a Moderation Board to maintain standards of the Masters Thesis.
Welcome to the YÖK-SUNY Dual Diploma program. This program will offer you a truly unique experience that will leave you well prepared to succeed in our increasingly global society. Not only will you be attending university in two different countries, but through this process you will emerge with a diploma from two very prestigious institutions, one in Turkey and one in the United States.
About the Program

This unique and innovative undergraduate program has been created by the Turkish Higher Education Council (YÖK) and The State University of New York (SUNY). Under this program the students will have the opportunity to:

- Earn a high-value undergraduate degree from a SUNY New Paltz and their respective Turkish university
- Study in both countries: live, study and attend classes in the United States and in Turkey
- Receive many benefits of an extended bicultural learning experience
- Develop excellent English language skills, both in the Turkish classroom and in a native English environment
- Complete a rigorous undergraduate degree program in less than four years
- Earn a Turkish degree and an American degree at a relatively low cost *

* A limited number of scholarships will be available
Academic Policies and Procedures

- Download Academic Policies & Procedures *
- Rules and Regulations for the METU TESOL Program *
1. Procedures and legal changes at National level can cause problems. A change to the American part of the programme led to changes being required to the Turkish documentation which required a vote by the Turkish Senate who questioned the need to make a change due to an American decision.
2. The dismissal of students. Be sure you understand how this works for all partners and that you have a procedure that is consistent.
The IMESS Double Degree

To complete the two-year IMESS programme all students spend the first year at the coordinating university (UCL) in London and the second year at one of the five partner universities. Click here for further details regarding the mobility pathways and information on each of the partner institutions.

On successfully completing the degree, all students will have attained 60 ECTS during each year of the programme. Each of the two universities attended by the student will award a full 120 ECTS Masters degree based on a common scheme of award. In other words, each successful IMESS student will receive an 'International Masters in Economy, State and Society with reference to Central and Eastern Europe - 'track name'' from University College London plus an MA from the relevant partner university as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Partner University</th>
<th>Name of Degree Awarded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CORVINUS UNIVERSITY OF BUDAPEST</td>
<td>Masters in International Relations: specialisation 'Economy and Business' or 'European Integration'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HELSINKI UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>Masters in Social Sciences: specialisation IMESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TARTU UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>Masters in Social Sciences: specialisation IMESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHARLES UNIVERSITY IN PRAGUE</td>
<td>Masters in International Area Studies with a specialisation in Central and East European Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAGIELLONIAN UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>Masters in European Studies: specialisation IMESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITI - HIGHER SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS</td>
<td>Masters in Political Science or Masters in International Economics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our first 2 cohorts of students represented 23 different countries (Belarus, Canada, China, Estonia, Germany, Ghana, Kazakhstan, Kosovo, Kyrgyzstan, Lithuania, Montenegro, Nigeria, Russia, Serbia, Slovakia, South Africa, Spain, Taiwan, Thailand, Ukraine, Uzbekistan, United Kingdom and United States) and come from diverse academic backgrounds (Economics, Business, Management, Politics, International Relations, History, Literature and Cultural Studies).
Principles, challenges, and features
(Richard Mole, IMESS Programme Director, UCL, UK)

1. For the first five years of the programme we only issued double degrees. We are currently in the process of re-applying for a further five years of funding and are moving towards joint degrees.
2. Other challenges have included coming up with a joint name. In Poland, for instance, there are restrictions on what you can call your degree programme. Our students going to Krakow therefore receive the IMESS degree from UCL but an MA in European Studies from Jagiellonian.
3. Also in Poland students doing MA European Studies are required to take courses from four of seven headings: ‘European civilisation’, ‘Collective Identities’, ‘EU Law’, ‘Financial Structures’, ‘EU Foreign Policy’, ‘Foreign Policy of Central & Eastern Europe’ and ‘Democracy’. Normally students on the MA European Studies would have two years to meet the various course requirements but as IMESS students spend only one year in Krakow, they have to take two of these options in their first year at UCL. Finding courses at UCL that would be acceptable to Jagiellonian - in the sense that they would fit under these seven headings - took a while.
4. Moreover, students on the Economics and Business track were unhappy at having to take courses on politics and society.
5. There were similar requirements at HSE, whereby non-economics students had to take an International Relations theory course at UCL in the first year - even if they were sociologists or historians.
6. Differences in quality assurance was an issue.
The overarching goal of this project is to improve higher education in health. The partners in this project are expanding an existing collaborative initiative between Laurea University of Applied Sciences in Finland, Nazareth College in the United States and Semmelweis University in Hungary. The partners share a common concern for preparing and retaining a well-educated nursing workforce. The expansion will improve higher education and health by preparing nurses with a global perspective to provide culturally competent care through the development of a transatlantic dual-degree program.

Specifically, the major goals of the program are:
1. Prepare a culturally competent international nursing workforce and globalize the nursing workforce through educational experiences.
2. Create mechanisms for the exchange of undergraduate students majoring in nursing.
3. Develop a dual-degree model to facilitate the growth of the nursing workforce by developing international nursing leadership with a global, trans-cultural perspective.
4. Share evidence-based practice standards for education that cross international boundaries.
Principles, challenges, and features
(Sandor Hollos, Semmelweis University Faculty of Health Sciences, Hungary)

1. We launched this project at 2007, and the first DD certificate was given in 2010.
2. The greatest challenges are:
   1. the mutual acceptance of the details of the curricula of partners,
   2. the credit transfer,
   3. the differences in the schedule of semesters of partners
   4. for the students: long time hosting at the other side of the ocean and the final requirements: thesis work in EU and HESI (comprehensive) exam in US.
3. In Spring 2010 Semmelweis University got the elite title of a “Research University” from the Ministry of Education, and in a declaration the Hungarian Accreditation Committee classified the internationalization activity of the Faculty of Health Sciences as “excellent”
4. More details can be found in our publication:
Principles, challenges, and features
(Raimonda Markeviciene, Vilnius University, Lithuania)

1. Agreeing the structure and programme was not a problem.
2. Graduation: Defence of master thesis. Each institution has their own requirements that are approved by the Universities Councils or Senates. Meeting them or getting institutional permissions for slight changes has been quite difficult. Also the idea had been that for the Defence of the thesis there should be some of the partners present. Eventually, the Defence Committee consisted only of local academics.
3. Another challenge was finances. One partner University could not sign the agreement and they were not given the right to issue this JP. The study period at that partner is being recognized by the other partners as a period abroad.
4. Registration of students: it is agreed that students get this diploma irrespective whether they e.g. studies in Verona or Vilnius, or not. That meant that ALL students had to be registered in our database even though they might never appear at the University. That caused a mental shock for our Study office.
SCO UNIVERSITY - Concept

Goals and Stages of Creation

SCO University should operate as a network of already existing universities in SCO Member States, as well as in observer states (Mongolia, India, Iran, and Pakistan). Training of highly qualified personnel at SCO University should be carried out in priority areas of cultural, scientific, educational, and economic cooperation of Shanghai Cooperation Organization Member States (Energy, Environment, Engineering, Metallurgy, Materials Science, Construction, Transportation, Fuel and Energy Complex, History, Linguistics, and IT-Technology).

Goals of creation of SCO University have been defined within SCO by multilateral legal instruments adopted by SCO Member States, and consist of the following:

- strengthening of mutual trust and good-neighborly relations between SCO Member States;
- development of integration processes in the field of education, science and technology;
- providing new impetus to the expansion of multilateral educational, scientific, and cultural cooperation;
- expanding opportunities for youth to receive quality modern education, and for teachers and scientists to develop scientific contacts;
- promoting effective cooperation of SCO Member States in political, economic, scientific-technical, and cultural fields.

At the present moment, creation of a full-scale SCO University would be premature for a number of reasons:

- lack of regulatory framework for mutual recognition of diplomas by all SCO Member States;
- partial mismatch of educational standards of SCO Member States;
- lack of high bandwidth Internet lines which makes it difficult to fully use modern electronic training media, and multimedia and telecommunications technologies;
- difficulty of coordination of forms and mechanisms of co-financing in accordance with the rules of decision making within SCO.
Closing Remarks

• Joint degree programmes are valuable additions to the global HE provision.
• A jointly developed degree programme with a single joint award is, I believe, the gold standard.
• Institutions should consider having an International Collaborative Provision Strategy/Policy
• A staged process to establishing joint degree programmes might be prudent
  • Produce an overall project plan with milestones and timescales.
  • Decide in which areas it is strategic to develop joint degree programmes.
  • For a particular scheme choose the appropriate partners and understand their system both Institutional and National.
  • Have in place a mechanism for testing the partners “policies and procedures” regarding degree programmes.
  • Develop a joint degree programme as a first step.
  • Trial this degree programme whilst remaining with separately awarded diplomas.
  • Develop the joint award.
“We may have all come on different ships, but we're in the same boat now.”

Martin Luther King Jr.
Thank you all for your attention

Questions?